

# Overview & Scrutiny Committee

Tuesday 13 March 2018

7.00 pm

Ground Floor Meeting Room G02A - 160 Tooley Street, London SE1  
2QH

## Supplemental Agenda

### List of Contents

Item No.	Title	Page No.
5.	Update on Ledbury Repairs Audit	1 - 6

<b>Item No.</b> 5	<b>Classification:</b> Open	<b>Date:</b> March 2018	<b>Meeting Name:</b> Overview and Scrutiny Committee
<b>Report title:</b>		Independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury Estate - Update	
<b>Ward(s) or groups affected:</b>		Livesey Ward	
<b>Cabinet Member:</b>		Councillor Stephanie Cryan, Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member For Housing	

At its meeting on 11 September 2017 the OSC recommended that the council carries out a full, thorough and independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury estate. It was also recommended, and subsequently noted by Cabinet on 19 September, that the relevant cabinet member should report back to the OSC.

This paper is therefore written in response to the OSC recommendation as noted by Cabinet.

### Background

1. Following the tragic Grenfell Tower fire, the council and the LFB jointly held a residents' meeting to listen to and respond to concerns about fire safety on Monday 26 June 2017. At that meeting, a resident reported cracks in their flat in one of the four 14 storey towers (Bromyard, Peterchurch, Skenfrith and Sarnsfield) on the Ledbury estate, expressing concern that these cracks breached the compartmentation of the flat and therefore compromised fire safety. The Strategic Director of Housing and Modernisation (SDHM), contacted the resident by email to arrange a visit by the Fire Safety team to inspect the cracks. The Fire Safety team carried out an inspection of the resident's flat on 29 June 2017 when it became clear that the gaps were significant. This raised concerns about the structural integrity of the block, and the other three tower blocks as well as the fire safety of the residents.
2. A new fire risk assessment was carried out on 30 June 2017 and the LFB were informed. The LFB carried out their own assessment of the tower blocks on the same day which required the council to put in place a number of remedial measures, all of which were designed to ensure that residents could remain in their homes during the investigative surveys and the temporary repairs to seal the breaches in compartmentation. This included walking wardens, the establishment of a control centre alongside numerous other measures whilst work was undertaken to seal any gaps between flats.
3. Arup, the leading civil engineering firm, were commissioned on Friday 30 June to inspect the building, initially investigating the reports of cracking and later the structure of the four tower blocks. Arup delivered their initial report on 10 August stating that they consider the blocks unsuitable for a piped gas supply. The blocks have had their gas supplies terminated as a precautionary measure due to the identified potential structural issue.

4. Keepmoat were appointed to upgrade the electrical rising mains in each block to enable the installation of immersion heaters to provide limited hot water and enable the purchase and distribution of electric standalone cookers.
5. Officers designed a district (communal) heating and hot water solution that could be quickly installed which was also delivered by Keepmoat. Through an expedited delivery, this was in full operation by mid-October.
6. Overview and Scrutiny Committee received a report on 11 September 2017 where they recommended to Cabinet that the council carries out a full, thorough and independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury estate as well as addressing more current issues regarding missed appointments being experienced by residents on the Ledbury estate. This was noted at the Cabinet on the 19 September 2017.
7. The council received a full structural report from Arup on 20 November 2017, that outlined that the buildings needed to be strengthened to meet the guidelines for disproportionate collapse for these types of buildings, set by the Building Research Establishment and the Department for Communities and Local Government in 2012.
8. The council continues to work with residents on the development of options for the Ledbury estate as reported to Cabinet on the 23 January 2018 and on 6 February 2018.
9. The resident project team, set up to oversee the works that would be required following the receipt of the Arup report, has received a report on the draft outline of a brief to appoint an independent consultant to carry out an options appraisal for the Ledbury Towers. The options may range from refurbishment, to partial demolition and re-provision to full re-development. The project team will be putting forward members to the appointment panel. .
10. A draft timeline based on the independent Consultant being appointed to carry out the options appraisal in March 2018 is as follows:
  - a. May/June 2018: Options appraisal work undertaken by the Consultant.
  - b. May 2018: Resident Project Team to meet to receive an update from the Independent Consultant for the options appraisal and to discuss and agree the final format of resident consultation on the options.
  - c. June 2018: Resident Project Team to meet to consider the draft report on the options produced by the Independent Consultant and consider the options to be put to residents.
  - d. July 2018: Resident Consultation on the options.
  - e. September/October 2018: Report to Cabinet on the Officers' recommendations, the results of the resident consultation and the wider impact on Southwark's Housing Strategy.
11. There are 66 empty properties, as some residents have taken the option to be re-housed, and 12 pre-allocated properties from the original 191 tenanted properties. All of the remaining tenants have registered for a move, though many wish to stay at Ledbury.
12. Further to the December 2017 Cabinet decision note the policy to allow the buy-back of leaseholder properties in Ledbury Towers (Bromyard House, Peterchurch House, Skenfrith House and Sarnsfield House), valuations have been received for the leasehold properties and consultation is underway with the leaseholders.
13. Sylvan Grove, a brand new block being purchased from Hyde Housing very close to the Ledbury estate with 80 properties for council rent, has now exchanged and is expected to

be handed over in March. A further purchase of Churchyard Row (HighPoint) is also expected to hand over in the next few months and will provide 115 homes, 79 expected to be at council rent.

14. The council is also working with the resident project team to appoint an independent consultant to carry out an options appraisal for the Ledbury Towers. A report will be going to Cabinet setting out the outcome of the resident consultation on the options appraisal process that is planned to be undertaken in July 2018.

## **KEY ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION**

### **Independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury Estate**

15. Overview and Scrutiny Committee at their meeting in September 2017, recommended that the Council carry out a full, thorough and independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury Estate. The committee further recommended that the Council urgently engages with contractors to ensure an end to the missed appointments currently being experienced by residents on the Ledbury Estate.
16. RSM were appointed by the Council to carry out an independent review of the repairs history of the Ledbury Estate. RSM is a leading provider of audit, tax and consulting services to middle market leaders, globally. RSM have an established relationship with the council carrying out independent reviews to manage risk as well as enhancing systems of governance and control.
17. RSM's brief was to perform a review of repairs history at the Ledbury Estate through reviewing the documentation held by the Council and the Council's processes and controls with a view to:
  - a. Ascertain various sources which are used to bring issues to the Council's attention;
  - b. Analyse the issues reported to the Council during a specified period
  - c. Understand the process for reporting and solving issues once the Council is made aware of them; and
  - d. Assess the Council's response to reports of various issues at Ledbury Estate.
18. RSM's review has encompassed working with the operations managers within the Council's housing team to understand the sources in which the issues could be identified and the processes and systems in place, then agreeing the level of detailed testing with the head of O&SC.
19. RSM have reviewed and tested the following sources for information:
  - a. iWorld repairs data: For the period between 1996 and 2013, Ledbury related data was collated from iWorld with a view to understanding any trends in terms of types of repairs;
  - b. Repairs reported between 2013 and 2017 were categorised across various repair 'types', for example, potential external leaks, roof, scaffolding, walls, ceiling, and windows. Following this categorisation, a sample of 125 items was selected for detailed testing. The sample was selected from a population that was skewed towards potential structural issues;

- c. Additional items were also tested from a number of sources, including disrepair claims, Member's enquiries, Major works files, and fire risk assessments. The following table sets out further details around the data sources selected for review, including the method in which issues can be raised, the substantive sample size agreed with the Council for testing of each source, and the availability of data for testing.

Data source	Method of flagging structural issues	Details	Sample size / data availability
<b>iWorld</b>	Residents alert the Contact Centre via telephone, e-mail, or the Council website.	iWorld is the system for tracking and completing normal repairs. The system includes the following information: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The original description of the repair from the resident.</li> <li>• The timeline of the issue.</li> <li>• The notes of each visit/inspection by the Council or contractors, as well as notes on completion/ cancellation of the repair.</li> </ul>	<b>125 cases</b> , to be extended if any key issues are noted within categories where the full population of that category has not been selected for testing.
<b>Monthly Council Inspections</b>	Inspections are planned on a rota and residents are free to attend.	A member of the repairs and maintenance technical team performs an inspection of the grounds and communal areas of each block on a 4-6-week rota depending on the estate.	<b>All reports</b> will be reviewed (dating back to December 2014), with any structural issues identified sampled for the appropriate follow up testing (iWorld or review of Major Works files).
<b>iCasework</b>	Complaints  Disrepair claims / Arbitration cases  Member enquiries  Freedom of Information Requests (FOI)	The iCasework system is set up to hold the following information: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Letters of claim and support for this</li> <li>- Copies of an initial FOI request.</li> <li>- The audit trail of the case; detail of any works raised with references and the progress through the schedule of works.</li> <li>- Technical team survey report.</li> <li>- Technical Survey feasibility reports.</li> <li>- Schedule of Works to rectify the complaint/claim.</li> <li>- FOI data provided to the requestor.</li> </ul>	<u>Complaints</u> - <b>8 items</b> dated from April 2012 selected, with a further 39 cases reviewed for relevance.  <u>Disrepair claims</u> – <b>12 items</b> dated from October 2016, with a further 35 items reviewed for relevance.  <u>Member enquiries</u> – <b>6 items</b> dated from April 2014, with a further 9 items reviewed for relevance.  <u>FOI requests</u> – all <b>5 items</b> available (dated from September 2015).
<b>Disrepair Claims Spreadsheet</b>	Disrepair claims – sent to Council Legal or Repairs	The disrepair claims spreadsheet provides the details of recorded disrepair claims. It includes details	As above; <b>12 items</b> dated from October 2016. Cross-referenced

Data source	Method of flagging structural issues	Details	Sample size / data availability
<b>et and Disrepair Files</b>	teams' inboxes	<p>of the caseworker and technical officer for the property.</p> <p>The Disrepair Files are saved on the housing shared drive (G Drive). There is duplication of the data on i-Casework, but it includes information for cases started prior to the full implementation of i-Casework in October 2016.</p>	from i-Casework to the spreadsheet and disrepair files.
<b>Major Works Files / EDMS and Apex</b>	<p>Residents meetings</p> <p>Technical inspections / surveys</p> <p>Repairs history review</p> <p>Stock condition surveys</p>	<p>The major works files are used to store:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Stock Condition Survey Feasibility Reports and consultant reports</li> <li>2. Technical Survey Feasibility Reports</li> <li>3. Residents Meeting Minutes</li> <li>4. Schedules of Works</li> <li>5. Contract Tenders</li> <li>6. Contractor completion certificates</li> <li>7. Consultant/contractor correspondence</li> <li>8. Defects logs</li> <li>9. Review of the repairs history</li> <li>10. Project manager trackers of issues</li> <li>11. Details of any emergency works</li> </ol> <p>EDMS is the electronic file storage system used by the repairs and maintenance team. This system holds:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Technical inspection photos and notes</li> <li>- Technical Survey Reports</li> </ul> <p>The Apex system acts as the stock records system. It includes a brief description of each property, a list of all its fixtures, the estimated useful life of each fixture, each fixtures installation date, expected replacement cost of each fixture, a high-level description of recent major works, noted regarding future major works to be completed and fire risk assessment actions.</p>	<p><b>All relevant files</b> reviewed. There are five major works projects from 2011 onward that have available data. All documents prior to this are unavailable or in deep storage.</p> <p><b>All relevant files</b> reviewed. Varying levels of data available from 1996 onward.</p> <p>Apex is a live system. Reports for each block in its current state reviewed.</p>
<b>Fire Risk Assessments</b>	Fire Compliance surveys	These show all the survey findings and recommended actions.	<b>All reports</b> from 2010 were reviewed with any structural issues identified sampled for the

Data source	Method of flagging structural issues	Details	Sample size / data availability
			appropriate follow up testing (iWorld or review of Major Works files)

20. The sample of repairs from iWorld and other sources was analysed and used to test:
- Process for identifying and reporting issues and repairs
  - Process for recording issues and repairs
  - Process for rectifying issues and repairs
  - The robustness of this approach

### Next steps

21. RSM has conducted a detailed and in-depth review and work is underway with RSM to ensure their report is accurate and comprehensive. A final check for evidence is also being undertaken. This work is expected to be complete by the end of March and the final independent report from RSM will be made available to both OSC and Cabinet from June 2018.

<b>Lead Officer</b>	Michael Scorer, Strategic Director of Housing and Modernisation	
<b>Report Author</b>	Dave Markham, Director of Asset Management	
<b>Version</b>	Final	
<b>Dated</b>	8 March 2018	
<b>Key Decision?</b>	No	
<b>CONSULTATION WITH OTHER OFFICERS / DIRECTORATES / CABINET MEMBER</b>		
<b>Officer Title</b>	<b>Comments Sought</b>	<b>Comments Included</b>
Director of Law and Democracy	Yes	Yes
Strategic Director of Finance and Governance	Yes	Yes
List other officers here		
<b>Cabinet Member</b>	Yes	Yes
<b>Date final report sent to Constitutional Team</b>		

